"*Loca Desiderarta*": Sacred Space and Holy Land Pilgrimage in Christian Culture

Ora Limor
Professor, The Open University of Israel

1. Introduction

Pilgrimage and sacred space are two highly related concepts. This article takes a broad historical and sociological approach to these subjects, but draws examples mostly from the Christian world and concentrates mainly on Jerusalem, as a notable example of a sacred space, and surely one of the most famous holy places in the world. Jerusalem is a particularly good choice of case-study because the city is holy to all three Abrahamic religions – Judaism, Christianity and Islam. Moreover, the myriad works that Jerusalem has inspired – literary as well as artistic – allows us to examine her from an exciting array of angles.

This virtual journey to Jerusalem will be based largely on evidence provided by eyewitnesses, namely, pilgrims who made the long journey to the Holy Land and put down their story in writing. Some of these stories were written by the pilgrims themselves while other stories were written by those who had observed such travels or had heard about them. At the background will be heard the voices of leading scholars of pilgrimage and sacred space. It should be noted, that unlike other religious phenomena, pilgrimage is gender-neutral, especially in Christianity. From the very beginnings of Christian pilgrimage in the fourth century, women hit the road, just like men. In Late Antiquity, when the Holy Land was under Christian rule, the number of women pilgrims known to us by name is quite large. Some of the travel narratives that have come down to us from that period were written by women or tell about women. However, women were much more affected than men by security problems and church regulations, so much so that there were periods when women's pilgrimage almost came to a standstill. As a general rule, one can say that when the pilgrimage movement was thriving, women were part of that boom. When it hit a slump, women disappeared from the roads.[1]

2. Christian Pilgrimage - Idea and Reality

Pilgrimage can be defined as a journey to a holy place. We might say that travel lies at the heart of religion – it is both an act of devotion and a metaphor for life. The biblical model for this paradigm is the patriarch Abraham, who left his people and his father's house to follow a divine command. (Genesis 12: 1) Setting out for pilgrimage generally entails giving things up: one's home, family, property – and certainly, comfort. In all religions, pilgrimage brings together walking and prayer. And in all religions, it brings together private impulse and customary ceremonies. The anthropologist Victor Turner famously understood pilgrimage as a rite of passage. Many societies use rites of passage to mark life transitions. Circumcision in Judaism turns a male baby into a Jew just as baptism turns a child a Christian. Confirmation in Christian societies and the Bar/Bat-Mitzva ceremony in Judaism mark a child's transition to adulthood, to full membership in his or her society. Some of these rites take place in sacred spaces – such as a synagogue or a church. Following the sociologist Arnold Van Gennep, Turner discerned in pilgrimage the three phases typically found in rites of passage. The first is departure from home and community; the second is the liminal phase (from the Latin word "limen" – threshold) – the journey and the stay at the holy place; and the third is the return home.[2] Among the three stages, the longest and most important is the second one, the liminal stage. In this stage, pilgrims free themselves from social bonds. Additionally, they develop strong feelings of brotherhood with their fellow travelers, which Turner defined as "communitas". Moreover, they show an inclination to ascetic behavior, to retrospection and to feelings of remorse. Although Turner's model was highly controversial, it is still a good starting point for any discussion of pilgrimage.[3]

Pilgrims traverse space, crossing from profane places to holy ones. They move from one holy place to another, as if reading chapters in a holy book, learning religious lessons through geographical places and through the liturgy enacted in them. Hardships along the way were approached as vital pilgrimage experiences. The longer and riskier the journey, the greater the religious value attached to it. Pilgrimage to Jerusalem was considered superior to more routine pilgrimages to holy places in the vicinity. Though this pilgrimage was to a remote place, on the margins of the pilgrim's geographical map, it was also a kind of center, the focus of Jewish and Christian religiosity, and important to Islam. Jerusalem's centrality, we may say, was universal and limitless.

Pilgrimage is a physical act loaded with symbolical meaning. The pilgrim walks on earthly roads but looks for mythical places. He moves forward, but aims backward, to the historical places of the past. He learns the ways of this world while attending to a world above, paradise or heavenly Jerusalem. While each of these motifs will suit one religion more than another, in all religions pilgrimage combines the physical and the spiritual, the past and the present, interiority and exteriority.

Pilgrims talk about seeing the holy places "with their own eyes", touching these places and praying in them. In Christianity, the holy places are witnesses to the great events that took place in them once, in the remote past: Jesus' birth, the miracles he performed, his death, resurrection and ascension. Although pilgrims are familiar with this foundational myth, it is revealed to them in a new light in the places where it occurred.

This strong impact of encounter with the holy places helps to explain why many pilgrims feel a need to put down their experiences in writing. Indeed, Christian pilgrimage gave birth to a specific genre, known as *itineraria* (itinerary), from the Latin word *iter*, meaning "way". This vast body of writings holds hundreds of works, the earliest of which go back to the beginning of Christian pilgrimage – and the last of which are still in the process of being written. The genre includes texts that were written by pilgrims, for pilgrims (that is, guides for pilgrims), or about pilgrims, and its main theme is the holy places and their sacred traditions. Those written in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages provide little information about flora and fauna or the people living in the places at the time of the visit. In this, they reflect the religious motivation of pilgrimage and also the special "pilgrimage discourse", namely, the way of speaking and writing about pilgrimage and about holy places.

Pilgrims' stories were conveyed both orally and in writing. Listeners and readers who remained at home could thus partake in the religious experience of pilgrimage. The pilgrims became agents of their communities, as pilgrimage stories had a didactic, educational value for the communities of believers. The stories also had a unifying value. The information gathered about the rites and liturgies of the Jerusalem church was learned and imitated in other places. Until this day, the rite of the Holy Fire, which takes place every year on the Holy Sabbath (one day after the crucifixion and before the Resurrection) attracts thousands of pilgrims from all over the world.[4] This is a miraculous event, in which new fire is said to materialize from Jesus' tomb without any human intervention. All the candles that were extinguished the previous

evening are lit by this fire, and also the candles of the clergy and pilgrims. Some pilgrims take home these burning candles in specific vessels. The atmosphere during the rite of the Holy Fire is nothing short of ecstatic.

We might wonder about the connection between pilgrimage and tourism.[5] After all, both involve curiosity and travel.[6] But pilgrimage, unlike tourism, is primarily motivated by a religious drive – even penitence, and sometimes a strong sense of repentance. In certain periods, the penitence component became central and turned the entire pilgrimage phenomenon into one long act of introspection and remorse. As an aside, it also should be mentioned that in the Middle Ages, Christian pilgrimage was sometimes used as a penalty for severe crimes. For example, in the eleventh century, the count Arduin of Ivrea, who murdered the bishop of Vercelli, was sentenced by the Church and the Imperial authorities to lifelong pilgrimage.[7] Nonetheless, in other cases pilgrimage was a self-inflicted penalty. Also in the eleventh century, Fulk Nerra, the count of Anjou, went to Jerusalem three times – in 1003, in 1010 and then in 1038 or 1039. The first pilgrimage was motivated by fear of hell, because of the blood that he had spilled in his many battles. This pilgrimage made a deep impression on him, and upon returning home he founded a monastery in his domain. He died on his way back from his third pilgrimage.[8] There were also pilgrims who went to die in Jerusalem. We shall come back to them at the end of this discussion.[9]

In Christianity, Judaism and Islam, the main motivation for pilgrimage is prayer in holy places. Holy places were considered closer to heaven and thus good for prayer. In fact, the pilgrim Egeria refers to pilgrimage as a “journey for the sake of prayer” ("causa orationis").[10] Egeria was a Christian traveler from Galicia in Spain who visited the holy places in the latter part of the fourth century. In addition to the holy places of the Holy Land she went also to Egypt, Sinai, Transjordan, and reached Constantinople and Mesopotamia. She also took part in the liturgies of the Church of Jerusalem and reported about them in detail. She described her adventures in a letter she wrote to her "beloved sisters", probably Christian friends back at home. The letter was discovered (although not in full) in the late nineteenth century, and is considered the first bud of Christian travel writing. In Judaism and Islam, there are also statements in favor of prayer in holy places, Jerusalem in particular.[11]

Although Christian pilgrimage was inspired both by Jewish pilgrimage to the Second Temple and by pagan traveling to historical and religious sites, it should be regarded as a new phenomenon and dealt with as such.[12] Unlike Jewish pilgrimage to

the Second Temple, Christian pilgrimage is not a religious commandment and there are no set rules for its performance. It also differs from pilgrimage to Mecca in Islam, which is one of the five religious duties of the Muslim. In each case there is one, and only one, destination for pilgrimage: Jerusalem or Mecca. Christian pilgrimage discussed here is more akin to the Muslim *Ziara*, pilgrimage to tombs of righteous people, to important mosques, or to living saints, such as great Sufi scholars.

Christian pilgrimage too started as a spontaneous act of individuals or groups, who felt the need to come close to the holy. Yet, it soon became a central element of Christian religious behavior, both as an act of devotion and as a metaphor of man's condition in this world as a stranger, a passer-by.[13] Although unlike in Judaism and Islam, in Christianity pilgrimage was never a religious obligation, it became a widespread movement among all Christian groups until the early modern period.[14] Untill this day Catholic and Greek-Orthodox Christians, as well as those of other groups, go to holy places, near and far, just like their fathers in ancient times. Alongside Jerusalem, Rome is also an important pilgrimage goal, and famous is also the traditional pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostella in Spain, in which pilgrims, men and women, young and old, make the famous *camino* by foot, treading time and again the same old route to the tomb of Saint James, Santiago. This traditional pilgrimage, which goes back hundreds of years (probably to the tenth century), created much of the lore of pilgrimage – legends, artifact, songs and music. It also introduced the famous symbol ("logo") of the Christian pilgrim: the shell.

As already mentioned, on a spiritual level, pilgrimage is a metaphor for human life. Every human being in this world is just a passer-by, a stranger. Paul addressed his fellow believers "as strangers and pilgrims" (1Peter, 2:11). The Latin term for pilgrim is *peregrinus*, originally a by-passer, a stranger. Indeed, the pilgrim leaves home and country in search of another home and another country – where he will find rest for his soul and meaning for his life. In all religions, pilgrimage in space is also a journey upwards to God, and inside to the soul. In the words of Victor and Edith Turner: "pilgrimage may be thought as extroverted mysticism, just as mysticism is introverted pilgrimage."[15] This is why so many important literary works take the notion of "journey" as their theme. We may think of the Odyssey in Greek culture, of Aeneas in Roman culture, of Dante's Divine Comedy, of Chaucer's Canterbury Tales, or the Arthurian Legends in Medieval Culture – among myriad more. In Jewish-Christian culture, we may think of the biblical Abraham, already mentioned above, the story of

the Exodus from Egypt, and the stories about Jesus, who himself died as a pilgrim to Jerusalem. Christian pilgrims walked in Jesus' footsteps in a double sense: they followed the roads that he traveled, and they followed the way of life that he modeled. This is why the pilgrimage to Jerusalem was considered "the pilgrimage of all pilgrimages"

3. Criticism of Pilgrimage

Up until this point in our discussion, we have taken pilgrimage in Christianity as an obvious ideal. However, the history of this phenomenon is more complex than meets the eye. For many authorities, the notion that believers should roam about seeking God raised alarm. Already Paul tells the people of Athens:

> The God who made the world and everything in it is the Lord of heaven and earth and does not live in temples built by human hands. And he is not served by human hands, as if he needed anything. Rather, he himself gives everyone life and breath and everything else. From one man he made all the nations, that they should inhabit the whole earth; and he marked out their appointed times in history and the boundaries of their lands. God did this so that they would seek him and perhaps reach out for him and find him, though he is not far from any one of us. (Acts 17: 24-27)

God is everywhere, says Paul – He has no need for a walled house of prayer. This is a direct criticism of Judaism, in which the cult of God could be held only at the Temple in Jerusalem and the Temple was the only pilgrimage goal. Additionally, however, Paul was critiquing any pilgrimage that involves serving God in specific places. Yet, as is well known, despite this powerful instruction, at least since the fourth century Christians started to stream to historical holy places in the Holy Land. While Christianity rejected the Jewish concept of the Temple, Christians were spotting the places where the dramatic events of the History of Redemption took place, building churches over them and attaching elaborate liturgies to them.[16]

The conflict between the original “spiritual” concept (the Paulian concept) and the developments in reality remained unresolved in Christianity, and criticism of pilgrimage was a by-product of the phenomenon itself.[17] Many Christian thinkers throughout the ages regarded pilgrimage to holy places with suspicion, as a distraction

from the true life of devotion.[18] These thinkers preferred an internal exile, into the soul, over the external one.[19] In the words of St. Jerome, the great Church Father of the fourth century: "Change of place does not bring us closer to God."[20] Notably, this was the same Jerome who went on pilgrimage with his friend and disciple Paula, and whose account of the journey remains one of the most important manifestos of early pilgrimage.[21] Jerome may have been ambivalent about the religious value of pilgrimage and he expressed different and even opposing ideas on the matter over time. Criticism of pilgrimage was especially strong at times when masses of pilgrims traveled to holy places. Such critique, however, wound up having little bearing on the religious behavior of the believers and on pilgrimage itself.

4. Jerusalem Pilgrimage

The reign of the first Christian emperor, Constantine the Great, in the fourth century, is considered the turning point of Holy Land Christianity. Christian sacred space was defined in his days, and the map of Christian holy places came into being.[22] His mother, Helena, visited the Holy Land in 326, a visit that could be seen as an Imperial declaration in favor of the holy places, marking in the Christian imagination the beginning of pilgrimage as a mass phenomenon.[23]

Pilgrimage blossomed around Easter and around the festival of the Dedication of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre (14 September). Egeria describes pilgrimage at that time as a wide and colorful phenomenon: men and women, monks and nuns, bishops and clerics of all ranks as well as lay people from near and far, all of them going to Jerusalem. And, while pilgrimage was not a religious precept, only those who had a good reason for not making the journey were exempted from doing so. In Egeria's words: "In fact I should say that people regard it as a grave sin to miss taking part in this solemn feast, unless anyone had been prevented from coming by an emergency".[24]

During the fourth century, pilgrimage became a great phenomenon and a prestigious act. While most pilgrims visited the holy places and returned home, there were others, like Jerome, who made the Holy Land their new home.[25] Among them were wealthy individuals who built churches and monasteries, and lived out their lives within these walls.[26] One example is Paula, Jerome's pilgrimage companion, who founded two monasteries in Bethlehem, one for men and the other for women.[27] Egeria, for her part, stayed for a lengthy period but eventually made her way home.[28] Her account is an impassioned witness of early Christian pilgrimage as a religious phenomenon and of

the attraction of the holy places to Christians.

Pilgrims came from the east and the west. In her description of the celebration of the festival of the dedication of the Holy Sepulchre Egeria mentions pilgrims who came from Mesopotamia, Syria, and Egypt, as well as from other provinces. Annual pilgrimages of large groups of Armenians have been recorded since the fifth century, and there were also many pilgrims from Georgia.[29] An anonymous pilgrim from the town of Piacenza in Italy, who traveled to the Holy Land in the sixth century (c. 570) writes that the hospice built in Jerusalem held a huge number of tables to cater to travelers and more than three thousand beds for the sick. He also mentions the cemetery for pilgrims in Akeldama, to the south of the city.[30]

The Roman Peace – *Pax Romana* – was an ideal setting for the flourishing of Christian pilgrimage. Roads were safe, dotted with hospices and stations where pilgrims could rest and change horses. A list of these facilities makes up the main part of the description of the Bordeaux Pilgrim, which describes a pilgrimage that took place in 333. This work is the first Christian account of pilgrimage that came down to us.[31] Like other travelers of his times, this anonymous traveler used the public road (*cursus publicus*), and went safely from one station to the other. The distance from one station to the other was a day travel (25-30 miles ride, or 15-20 miles on foot).[32] From Bordeaux in France to Jerusalem the pilgrim traveled about 3400 miles, some 170 days of travel, calculated on the basis of 20 miles per day. His road took him from France to Italy, and then through the Balkan to Constantinople and Syria. To Palestine he arrived from the north, going down by the seashore, turning eastwards to Neapolis, Samaria, and Beth El and then to Jerusalem. From Jerusalem he set out for a few short excursions, to Jericho, Bethlehem and Hebron. The land route was safer but longer, and some pilgrims preferred to go by sea. Paula, for example, went from Italy by the Adriatic Sea to Cyprus, then to Syria and from there she rode an ass southwards to Palestine. Egeria writes that in less-secure places, she and her company were escorted by imperial guard.[33]

Pilgrimage to the holy places is strongly connected to the monastic movement. Monks living near the holy places took care of the pilgrims, providing them with food and shelter. Many monasteries had hospices for pilgrims (*xenodochia*).[34] The monks also looked after the pilgrims' spiritual needs.[35] They were the guides in the holy sites, performed the special pilgrimage liturgy in them, and gave the pilgrims *eulogiae*, "blessings", namely, souvenirs that held benedictory powers.[36] These blessed

souvenirs were taken by the pilgrims back home as a memo and a bond to the holy places. Sometimes these souvenirs were placed in the local church, making the pilgrim a delegate of his community. Famous among the Holy Land souvenirs are the *ampullae*, small flasks, made of glass, pottery or metal, holding oil from Jerusalem and stamped with the image of the Church of the Holy Sepulcher.[37]

More important than these souvenirs were relics of holy objects – foremost among them relics of the True Cross, the cross on which Jesus was crucified. According to a famous legend, the Cross was discovered in the fourth century and was kept in the Church of the Holy Sepulcher until it was transferred to Constantinople in the seventh century.[38] Relics of the Holy Cross and of other venerated objects that touched Jesus, or his mother Mary, were costly and difficult to obtain. Veneration of them was a by-product of pilgrimage, and a distinct feature of Christian culture.

These main traits of Holy Land pilgrimage were formed in Late Antiquity and remained valid for hundreds of years, despite changes caused by external circumstances, such as the political situation in the Holy Land and on the way to it, or internal developments in Christian piety.

In the sixth century the Roman hold on the region started to weaken, and pilgrims' routes became less safe. Bedouin raiding made some of the roads dangerous and limited the contours of the visited area. Then, in the seventh century, the Holy Land was conquered by two powers. The Persians conquered Jerusalem in 614 and controlled it for sixteen years. Then, in 638, Jerusalem was taken over by the Muslims, who held it until the Crusader conquest in 1099. The first Muslim period was not homogeneous with respect to Christian pilgrimage. Sometimes Muslim rulers made things difficult for pilgrims, but more often they tolerated Christian pilgrims and treated Christian holy places with respect.[39] The few Latin travel descriptions that came down to us from this period tell of a continuous, albeit limited, presence of western pilgrims in the Holy Land. One of them was Willibald, a monk from England who went to Rome and then to Jerusalem in the twenties of the eighth century. After returning home, he became a missionary in Bavaria and a local saint. Willibald went to Jerusalem in a group of eight Englishmen, and although he tells about hardships caused by the Muslims, he did not seem to be in a hurry to leave the Muslim territories. For three years he roamed about the holy places, and returned to Jerusalem no less than four times.[40]

Another pilgrim, the French monk Bernard (870), supplies in his short travel account a wealth of information about licenses, travel certificates, fees, distances and travel arrangements.[41] This kind of information was important mainly for other travelers who intended to cross to Muslim lands. Bernard praises the order and discipline in these lands, and it seems that after paying the required taxes and getting the needed certificates Christian pilgrims could travel through Muslim lands in safety.

The eleventh century witnessed a new invigoration of pilgrimage. Travel conditions improved after the conversion to Catholicism of the king of Hungary in the year 1000. He welcomed European pilgrims to cross to Byzantium through his land and thus to avoid the dangers of travelling by sea and in Muslim ships.[42] The new fascination for Jerusalem was also part of the special religious atmosphere of the time and an expression of it. The eleventh century saw a religious revival and a new kind of pietism loaded with guilt, anxiety about sin, and broad movements of repentance and penitence. Setting out for pilgrimage to Jerusalem was one expression of this new piety. Some scholars connect these phenomena with the year 1000 and the expectations for the events of the End of Times to begin – the resurrection of the dead, the Last Judgment and the *parousia*, Jesus' second coming, that according to some apocalyptic calculations will take place one thousand years after his birth, or after his resurrection.[43]

These great pilgrimages of the eleventh century can be seen as an overture to the Crusades. Scholars remind us that at the beginning of the Crusades there was no special terminology for the new phenomenon. The Crusaders were termed pilgrims (*peregrini*) and the crusade – pilgrimage (*peregrinatio*). Yet, there was one crucial difference: the Crusaders bore weapons and prepared themselves to free Jerusalem for Christianity. They were armed pilgrims.

In the twelfth century, the crusader victory placed the Holy Land once again under Christian rule. Consequently, the number of pilgrims to Jerusalem rose. For those going by sea, the journey to the Holy Land and back to Europe took at least half a year.[44] Travel conditions were hard. Ships were small, crowded, and dirty, food scarce and bad, and travelers were under constant threat of sickness, plague, storms and pirates. Because of these perils there were many who preferred to go by land, via Constantinople. Pilgrims' convoys at that time were colorful and included people of all ranks, from princes and magnates to beggars, and from bishops and abbots to simple monks and priests. The pilgrims could be recognized by the staffs and bags that were

given to them by their local priests, and by the crosses that were stitched to their dresses.

Pilgrimage remained a big movement throughout the Late Middle Ages, even after Jerusalem was retaken by the Muslims. The loss of the Holy Land made pilgrimage, once again, the most important outlet for Christian longing for the historical holy places. This is attested by the hundreds of pilgrimage accounts that have come down to us from the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries.

5. Holy Place, Sacred Space

The Bible, which underlies both Judaism and Christianity, has some very famous examples of such places. For example, on his way from Beer Sheba to Mesopotamia, the patriarch Jacob stopped at a certain place for the night, putting a stone under his head. While asleep he had a dream in which he saw a ladder resting on the earth, with its top reaching to heaven, and angels of God ascending and descending on it. And he heard God speaking to him and blessing him, promising to watch over him. When he awoke up, he said: "How dreadful is this place! This is none other but the house of God, and this is the gate of heaven". Then he took the stone on which he slept, poured oil on it and called the place Beth-El: The house of God (Genesis 28: 17-19).

Another famous example of biblical holy places is taken from the book of Exodus. Moses was tending the flock of his father-in-law when an angel appeared to him in flames of fire from within a bush. Although the bush was on fire, it did not burn up. When Moses approached the bush, God said to him from the burning bush: "Do not come any closer, take off your shoes, for the place where you are standing is holy ground"(Exodus 3: 5).

6. Gate to Heaven

As these examples show, holy places are special sites where humans have received divine revelation. In these sites of theophany, it is as if the sacred irrupted, demarcating the spot from the rest of the world. The famous scholar of religion, Mircea Eliade, distinguished between the realm of secular experience and the realm of religious experience. While in profane experience "space is homogenous and neutral", for a religious man "a sacred space possesses existential power".[45] "Every sacred space, writes Eliade, implies a hierophany, an irruption of the sacred that results in detaching a territory from the surrounded cosmic milieu and making it qualitatively

different."[46] Such an irruption of the sacred was witnessed by Jacob, who took up the stone that had been his pillow when he slept, set it up as a monument, poured oil on it and called it Beth-El, the house of God. The theophany that occurred there made the place sacred and linked it directly to heaven, "the gate to heaven" in Jacob's words. Based on these two examples, we can draw up a list of key characteristics of sacred places: First, Jacob and Moses did not look for these places. They were mysteriously revealed to them. Second, the revelation (theophany) changed forever the nature of the places and made them unique, other.[47] Third, the sacrality is indelible. Once revealed, holiness is attached to the sacred places forever. And fourth, God reveals himself only to chosen people (Jacob, Moses, the prophets) and He does so only in chosen places. Holy places commemorate extraordinary, symbolical, events that happened, within their boundaries, to holy people. Such a case is Mount Sinai, where Moses received the Law. As we read in the Bible:

> Mount Sinai was covered with smoke, because the Lord descended on it in fire. The smoke billowed up from it like smoke from a furnace, and the whole mountain trembled violently (Exodus 19:18).

Mount Sinai is the quintessential holy place. The revelation that occurred on it changed its nature. It started to smoke and trembled like a human being. People were not allowed to touch it, as God instructs Moses:

> Put limits for the people around the mountain and tell them, "Be careful that you do not approach the mountain or touch the foot of it. Whoever touches the mountain is to be put to death" (Exodus 19:18).

For late antique and medieval pilgrims, sacred space itself was a marvel, an exalted territory imbued with divine grace. Otherwise blind to landscapes, weather, flora and fauna, as well as to the living people they encountered on the route, pilgrims took a deep interest in natural phenomena which they considered testimonies to the sublime events that took place there in the formative past, in the founding moments of the faith. The stones on the ground, the spring water and the flow of brooks were viewed as the imprint of sublime events, as preserving the divine; namely, as sacred landscapes. The Holy Land has an abundance of stones supposed to be capable of healing or preventing

barrenness; of fruit that ripens early or reaches unusual dimensions; of springs that heal incurable illnesses.[48] Not only do various objects in the holy places express sanctity, the geography itself – the hills and valleys and the mountain slopes – reveals divine grace. Egeria, who was an adventurer and undeterred by hardships, climbed Mount Sinai on foot, and was fascinated by its fantastic topography. Her description gives voice to the feelings holy places aroused when first seen by pilgrims:

> Then, going on, we made our way across the valley and approached the Mount of God.[49] It looks like a single mountain as you are going around it, but when you actually go into it there are really several peaks, all of them known as "the Mount of God", and the principal one, the summit on which the Bible tells us that "God's glory came down" (Exodus 19: 18, 20), is in the middle of them. I never thought I had seen mountains as high as those which stood around it, but the one in the middle where God's glory came down was the highest of all, so much so that when we were on top, all other peaks we had seen and thought so high looked like little hillocks far below us. Another remarkable thing – it must have been planned by God – is that even though the central mountain, Sinai proper on which God's glory came down, is higher than all others you cannot see it until you arrive at the very foot of it to begin your ascent. After you have seen everything and come down, it can be seen facing you, but this cannot be done till you start your climb. I realized it was like this before we reached the Mount of God, since the brothers [the hermits who lived near the Mount] had already told me, and when we arrived there I saw very well what they meant.[50]

Egeria came from Galicia in Spain, so she had probably seen high mountains in her homeland as well as on her way to the Holy Land. And still, holy mountains were considered different. Their height and structure bore a message. They embodied the sublime. Egeria was sure that the way the Mount of God, Sinai, towers higher than all other mountains so that one cannot see it before ascent but only after it "must have been planned by God". This is where God came down to give the Bible and the landscape itself reveals the uniqueness and holiness of it. Just as this revelation of God changed the course of human history (time), it also shaped geography (space).

A similar idea is expressed by the Russian abbot Daniel, who came on pilgrimage to the Holy Land in 1107 (beginning of the Crusader period) and wrote a detailed

description of what he had seen. He describes the soil of Jerusalem in biblical terms:

> And good crops grow about Jerusalem in that rocky land without rain; Wheat and barley grow in abundance by God's benevolent will – if you sow one measure you reap ninety or hundred. Is not this holy land blessed by God?[51]

Text written by pilgrims such as Egeria and the abbot Daniel define the holy places as "icons of nature", to borrow a term from the renown scholar of visual culture, W.J.T. Mitchell. Mitchell writes:

> Landscape is a medium not only for expressing value but also for expressing meaning, for communication between persons – most radically, for communication between the Human and the non-Human."[52]

Like an icon, the holy landscape is an object of veneration and contemplation. It exists simultaneously in the immediate earthly sphere and in the heavenly, symbolic one, demonstrating God's grace in his creation. When looked at together, these iconic places create a map, a holy map – the map of sacred geography. Pilgrims who went to Jerusalem held in their minds an imaginary map drawn out of place names they read in the Bible or heard in homilies delivered in churches. In the holy places they charged this map with additional meaning, adding sights to names.[53] The Bible served as a guide for this map, which was nevertheless subject to change according to cultural inclinations and historical events. As put by Maurice Halbwachs: "Sacred places thus commemorate not facts certified by contemporary witnesses but rather beliefs… which form the basis of many of the essential dogmas of Christianity."[54] The sacred map is a map of beliefs.

7. The Omphalos, Center of the World

Mircea Eliade argued that religious people have always sought to fix their abode at the "center of the world". The discovery of the center gives order and orientation to the homogeneity and relativity of profane space. This geographical center is the *axis mundi*, the navel, or the omphalos, the cosmic place from which creation begun.[55] For Christians this place is Golgotha; in Judaism, it is the foundation stone on the Temple Mount (Haram al-Sharif in Islam), where the Temple once stood. Both places are in

Jerusalem. According to Jewish tradition, Eretz Israel is situated at the center of the world, Jerusalem at the center of Eretz Israel, the Temple at the center of Jerusalem, the tabernacle at the center of the Temple, and the foundation stone in front of it. From this stone, so the teaching runs, the world was founded.[56]

In fact, Jerusalem is sometimes depicted as a perfect circle on a hill. A cosmic city, it is here that earth and heavens meet. Jerusalem is the ultimate holy place. Pilgrimage to it was defined by Victor Turner as "prototypical pilgrimage",[57] and the historian of literature Donald Howard defined it "the pilgrimage of all pilgrimages".[58] Jerusalem's status in the Abrahamic religions is beyond question, like the Scriptures themselves. Like the Bible, Jerusalem's area of influence is worldwide and ecumenical. Scholars who study pilgrimage use the term "catchment area" to describe the sphere of influence of holy places.[59] The majority of holy places draw people from the vicinity. These are local holy places. More important ones draw people from a wider region. These are regional holy places. But the most venerable are the universal holy places that draw pilgrims from across the globe. Rome and Santiago of Compostela in Spain are examples of such places in Christianity; Mecca – in Islam. Jerusalem, however, is a center for all three Abrahamic religions – Judaism, Christianity and Islam. One may say that her "force field" is boundless, both in geographic and in religious terms.[60]

Famously, holy places tend to maintain their sacrality even after change of ownership. Pagan holy places all over Europe became churches, as religious leaders understood that it is easier to change the story of a place than to erase it. People who have prayed in a place perceived as possessing metaphysical or magical power will continue to visit that place, even in the face of prohibitions. Such sacred continuity is omnipresent in Jerusalem. Over time, the city became a massive mosaic of holy places, old and new. And thus, although from the political and economic perspective Jerusalem was long a peripheral city, it has always been a place of ultimate desire and the center of dreams for believers. Those who could not reach Jerusalem constructed models of it, admired its relics and souvenirs, and sang it songs of longing.

8. Stage of the Historical Drama

For Christians, the sacred map of the Holy Land is the stage of the historical drama that underlies the very essence of Christianity. The places on the map – Nazareth, Bethlehem, the Lake of Galilee, the Jordan River and, above all – Jerusalem, witnessed the drama of redemption and prove its veracity. Pilgrims can not meet

people who took part in the sublime events, but they can visit the places where they occurred. The peak is the visit to Golgotha, the place where Jesus' cross stood, where he was crucified, and the nearby Holy Sepulcher, where he was buried and from where he resurrected. All these events are impressed in the materiality of the places. In the Gospel of Matthew, we read about the moment of Jesus' death:

> And when Jesus had cried out again in a loud voice, he gave up his spirit. At that moment the curtain of the temple was torn in two from top to bottom. The earth shook, the rocks split and the tombs broke open (Mat. 27:51)

To this day, one can see the rift that, according to Christian tradition, was created at the moment of Jesus' death. The rift confirms the story of the Gospels. In the same way, the marks on the stone in the Ascension Church atop the Mount of Olives are considered to be Jesus' footprints, imprinted there forever at the moment he ascended, and the footprints on the Temple Mount corroborates the tradition, based on an interpretation of a verse from the Quran, about Muhammed's night journey (Isra) from Mecca to Jerusalem, from where he ascended to heaven (Miraj).

Many of the holy places are recognizable by the magnificent buildings that have been erected over them – chapels, churches or monasteries. Often at the heart of such buildings lies a natural object which is the raison d'etre of the place. It may be a rock, a cave, a fountain or an old tree. These objects are usually older than the structure that was erected above them, structures that were built in order to guard them. To the examples already mentioned, we may add the rock where Jesus prayed in agony before he was arrested, or even the trees in the garden of Gethsemane, believed by pilgrims to go back to Jesus' times (although scientific tests date them no earlier than the 16th century). All these natural objects have a double meaning: they are believed to be direct links to heaven and thus prayer near them is better heard by God; and they corroborate the stories of the Bible and make them meaningful. They serve to support the believer's imagination. Jerome writes:

> In the same way that those who have seen Athens understand the Greek histories better, […] so he who has contemplated Judaea with his own eyes and knows the sites of the ancient cities, and knows the names of the places whether the same or changed, will regard Scripture more lucidly.[61]

According to Jerome, historical holy places play a didactic role. They attest to the events that took place therein, and make it possible to understand them better. Pilgrimage to these places transforms the pilgrim, but it also transforms the Holy Land – making it a cultural, religious and geographical center, a "scriptural territory" in which landscape stands as witness to the biblical narrative.[62]

9. Liturgical Space

Holy places are also ceremonial centers. Pilgrims who are lucky enough to arrive at these places and to take part in the liturgies enacted in them are transported backward in time. In Golgotha, they see the Crucifixion; in Bethlehem, they see baby Jesus in the manger. When Cyril, bishop of Jerusalem in the fourth century, preached to his congregation, he told them how lucky they were. "Others only hear [the stories of the Scriptures] while we see and touch", he said.[63] It is in this vein that the anthropologist Jonathan Smith concluded: "Only in holy places can the believer experience past as present".[64]

A lovely example of such a believer is, again, Egeria. She describes how guides (usually local monks) escort pilgrims to the holy places, where they listen to the story of the event that happened in the place and learn of its significance. Relevant chapters from the Holy Scriptures are read, and the pilgrims and monks pray together and sing hymns. Egeria writes:

> And it was always our practice when we managed to reach one of the places we wanted to see to have first a prayer, then a reading from the book, then to say an appropriate psalm and another prayer. By God's grace we always followed these practices whenever we were able to reach a place we wanted to see.[65]

It is astonishing to learn how little this procedure has changed since Egeria's days, at the beginning of the pilgrimage movement in the fourth century. Relating to the holy places' liturgy, Jonathan Smith aptly writes: "In Jerusalem, story, ritual, and place could be one".[66]

10. Loca Desiderata

Beyond all these important reasons for pilgrimage to holy places, there is the emotional, almost erotic, appeal. The holy places are places full of pathos, and

pilgrims spoke about them in terms of desire and longing. Jerome writes that his friend and disciple Paula left the famous abodes of the hermits in Egypt because of her greater desire for the holy places. And Egeria calls the holy places "loca desiderata" – longed-for places.[67] Indeed, these places have the power to stimulate a person to leave his home, to forget about family and livelihood, and to go down a difficult, dangerous road from which he might not return. The great medieval Jewish poet R. Yehuda Halevi wrote with yearning about Jerusalem in a famous poem:

> O fair of view! World's joy! Great monarch's home!
> For you, from earth's far end, my spirit yearns.[68]

11. Death and Resurrection in Jerusalem

As Jerusalem is widely believed to be the nearest place to heaven on earth, many pilgrims aimed to die and be buried there. The Abrahamic religions share a belief in the resurrection of the dead. In all three, the events of the end of time, the eschatological events, will take place in Jerusalem. There will take place the resurrection and the Last Judgment, in which God will sentence all human beings to eternal life or to eternal death. For many Christian believers, this closeness between earth and heaven was the main reason for going on pilgrimage. Some intended to end their life in Jerusalem, so as to be close to the place of resurrection and second coming of Jesus. An appealing story penned by the eleventh-century French historian Rudolf Glaber, told in his book of histories, brings such a case. He tells about Lethbald, a pilgrim from Burgundy, that after having visitedt all the holy places he reached the spot on the Mount of Olives from which Jesus ascended into heaven, the place where it is promised that he will come to judge the living and the dead. There Lethbald raised his hands towards heaven and asked Jesus that if he is to die that year it may happen within sight of that place. His wish was granted, and he died the same evening. Glaber concludes:

> Many return from the Jerusalem journey wanting simply to be admired, but he was truly free from that vanity. In the name of the Lord Jesus, he trustingly asked what also he received. His companions told us these things when they came back here again.[69]

This is a moral story, an exemplum, and in it Lethbald is presented as the perfect pilgrim. Unlike other pilgrims, his journey to Jerusalem was motivated by piety rather than by pretense. The story conveys the belief that Jerusalem is the gateway to heaven and thus the ideal place to meet death. It also emblematizes the very idea of pilgrimage. The Christian pilgrim goes to Jerusalem in the footsteps of Jesus, and he wishes to die in Jerusalem like him. He also follows the way of life Jesus set forth. Such a pilgrim imitates Jesus in life and in death. This is nothing less than *immitatio Christi* - imitation of Christ. Lethbald's request to die in Jerusalem also expresses his belief in the expiating power of pilgrimage. After making the way and achieving his geographical goal, he also asks to achieve his spiritual goal by dying in Jerusalem and reaching heaven in his new, purified condition.[70]

Lethbald chose the Mount of Olives as his preferred place to meet God in Jerusalem. According to Christian tradition, Jesus ascended to heaven from that site and he will return there at the end of times to judge the living and the dead. Jews share with Christians the beliefs in the eschatological importance of the Mount, and Muslims adopted them, in some variants, as well.[71] We know of Christians, Jews, and Muslims who came to Jerusalem in old age in order to end their lives there and be buried close to the place of resurrection.

Connected to these beliefs is the idea of the Heavenly Jerusalem, a key concept in the Christian religious worldview. Early Christianity opposed heavenly Jerusalem to the earthly city, situated on the hills of Judea. Historical Jerusalem was for them a sinful Jewish city that rejected Jesus and sent him to a cruel death, and it was cursed by Jesus himself as told in the Gospel of Luke (19: 43-44). However, ideas like these could not annul the attraction earthly Jerusalem had for pilgrims, and, despite criticism of the city, her importance grew over time. Many believers looked for the heavenly city within the earthly one, and depicted the latter in light of their lofty expectations. For them, Jerusalem on earth was the gateway to heaven, the center of the world, the holy of holies.

1 Ora Limor, "Women Pilgrims to the Holy Land: From Egeria to Margery Kempe", in *A Companion to Medieval Pilgrimage* (Andrew Jotischky and William Purkis eds., ARC Humanities Press [forthcoming]). The present article is based in part on former works of mine. See among others: Ora Limor, "'Holy Journey': Pilgrimage and Christian Landscape" in *Christians and Christianity in the Holy Land: From the Origins to the Latin Kingdoms* (Ora Limor and Guy G. Stroumsa, eds., Turnhout: Brepols, 2006), 321-353.

2 See Victor Turner, "Pilgrimages as Social Processes", in Turner, *Dramas, Fields and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1974), 166-230**.**

3 See John Eade and Michael Salnow, "Introduction", in Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage (John Eade and Michael Salnow, eds., London and New York: Routledge, 1991), 1-29.

4 Andrew Jotischky, "Holy Fire and Holy Sepulchre: Ritual and Space in Jerusalem from the Ninth to the Fourteenth Centuries," in *Ritual and Space in the Middle Ages: Proceedings of the 2009 Harlaxton Symposium* (Frances Andrews, ed., Donington: Shaun Tyas, 2011). 44-60**;** Benjamin Z. Kedar, "Le miracle du Feu sacré à Jérusalem: des origines à suppression papale," in *De la Bourgogne à la Orient: Mélanges offerts à Monsieur le Doyen Jean Richard* (Jacques Meissonnier et al., eds., Dijon: Académie des sciences, arts et belles-lettres de Dijon, 2020), 519-529.

5 Eric Cohen, "Tourism as Play," *Religion* 15 (1985), 291-304.

6 It should be mentioned that in Christianity curiosity is not necessarily a positive value. It is the original sin, which caused the expulsion from the Garden of Eden. See Christian K. Zacher, Curiosity and Pilgrimage: The Literature of Discovery in Fourteenth-Century England (Baltimore and London: John Hopkins University Press, 1976).

7 Sarah Hamilton, *The Practice of Penance, 900-1050* (Woodbridge, England: Boydell & Brewer, 2001), 13, 173-4.

8 Bernard S. Bachrach, "The Pilgrimage of Fulk Nerra, Count of the Angevins, 987-1040," in *Religion, Culture, and Society in the Early Middle Ages: Studies in Honor of Richard E. Sullivan*, [Studies in Medieval Culture. 23]; (Thomas F.X. Noble and John J. Contreni, eds., Kalamazoo, Michigan: Western Medieval University, 1987) 205–217.

9 See Jonathan Sumption, *Pilgrimage: An Image of Mediaeval Religion* (London: Faber and Faber, 1975), 131-132.

10 *Itinerarium Egeriae*, 13, 1; 17, 1 (Aet Franceschini and Robert Weber, eds., Corpus Christianorum Series Latina [CCSL] 175, *Itineraria et alia geographica*, Turnhout: Brepols, 1965). 54, 58.

11 Midrash on Psalms 91, 7, Buber, p. 400; Amikam Elad, *Medieval Jerusalem and Islamic Worship* (Leiden: Brill, 1999), 63.

12 John Wilkinson, "Jewish Holy Places and the Origins of Christian Pilgrimage," in *The Blessings of Pilgrimage* (Robert Ousterhout, ed., Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press,1990), 41-53; E. D. Hunt, "Travel, Tourism and Piety in the Roman Empire," *Echos du monde classique* 28 (1984), 391-417; Lionel Casson, *Travel in the Ancient World*, London: George Allen and Unwin, 1974).

13 Gerhart B. Ladner, "*Homo Viator*: Mediaeval Ideas of Alienation and Order," *Speculum* 42

(1967), 233-259; Brouria Bitton-Ashkelony, "Pilgrimage in Monastic Culture in Late Antiquity," in *The Armenians in Jerusalem and the Holy Land* (Michael E. Stone, Roberta R. Ervine, Nira Stone, eds., Leuven: Peeters, 2002), 1-17.

14 This is not the case in Protestant Christianity which is outside the scope of this paper.

15 Victor Turner and Edith L.B. Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1978), 33.

16 E.D. Hunt, *Holy Land Pilgrimage in the Later Roman Empire AD 312-460* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982). On the shaping of the term Holy Land see Robert L. Wilken, *The Land Called Holy: Palestine in Christian History and Thought* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1992), 166-172.

17 Brouria Bitton-Ashkelony, *Encountering the Sacred: The Debate on Christian Pilgrimage in Late Antiquity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005).

18 Bitton-Ashkelony, "Pilgrimage in Monastic Culture".

19 Giles Constable, "Opposition to Pilgrimage in the Middle Ages," *Studia Gratiana* 19 (1976), 125-146; Giles Constable, "Monachisme et pèlerinage au Moyen Ages," *Revue historique* 258 (1977), 3-27.

20 Hieronymus, *Epistulae*, 58.3 (Isidor Hilberg, ed., Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum [CSEL] 54, ed., Vienna: Tempsky, 1912), 530-531.

21 Hieronymus, *Epistulae*, 108 (Isidor Hilberg, ed., CSEL 55, Vienna: Tempsky, 1912) 306-351; English translation: John Wilkinson, *Jerusalem Pilgrims before the Crusades* (Warminster: Aris and Phillips, 2002[2]) 79-91.

22 Joan E. Taylor, *Christians and the Holy Places: The Myth of Jewish-Christian Origins*, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993) 295-332; Wilken, *The Land Called Holy*, 82-100.

23 Kenneth G. Holum, "Hadrian and St. Helena: Imperial Travel and the Origins of Christian Holy Land Pilgrimage," in *The Blessings of Pilgrimage*, 66-81; Hunt, *Holy Land Pilgrimage*, 28-49.

24 *Itinerarium Egeriae*, 49; English translation: John Wilkinson, Egeria's *Travels* (London: S.P.C.K, 1971), 146-147.

25 Hunt, *Holy Land Pilgrimage*, index; J.N.D. Kelly, *Jerome: His Life, Writings, and Controversies* (Worcester and London: Duckworth, 1975).

26 Peter Brown, *The Body and Society: Men, Women and Sexual Renunciation in Early Christianity* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988) 259-284; Leslie Brubaker, "Memories of Helena: Patterns in Imperial Female Matronage in the Fourth and Fifth Centuries," in *Women, Men and Eunuchs: Gender in Byzantium* (Elizabeth James, ed., London and New York: Routledge, 1997) 52-75.

27 Hieronymus, *Epistulae*, 108.

28 Hagith Sivan, "Who was Egeria? Piety and Pilgrimage in the Age of Gratian," *Harvard Theological Review* 81 (1988), 59-72.

29 *Itinerarium Egeriae*, 49; see also A. Kuelzer, "Byzantine and early post-Byzantine Pilgrimage to the Holy Land and to Mount Sinai," in *Travel in the Byzantine World* (Ruth Macrides, ed., Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002) 149-161; Michael E. Stone, "An Armenian Pilgrim to the Holy Land in the Early Byzantine Era," *Revue des études arméniennes* 18 (1984), 173-178; Michael E. Stone, "Holy Land Pilgrimage of Armenians before the Arab Conquest," *Revue*

biblique 93 (1986) 93-110.

30 *Itinerarium Antonini Placentini*, 24, 26 (P. Geyer, ed., CCSL, 175) 127-174; English translation: Wilkinson, *Jerusalem Pilgrims*, 129-151.

31 *Itinerarium Burdigalene* (P. Geyer and O. Cuntz, eds., CCSL, 175), 1-26; English translation of the Holy Land section: Wilkinson, *Egeria's Travels*, 22-34.

32 Casson, *Travel in the Ancient World*.

33 *Itinerarium Egeriae*, 7, 9.

34 Joseph Patrich, *Sabas, Leader of Palestinian Monasticism: A Comparative Study in Eastern Monasticism*, *Fourth to Seventh Centuries* Washington D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks,1995); Yizhar Hirschfeld, *The Judean Desert Monasteries in the Byzantine Period* (New Haven: Yale University press,1992), 196-200.

35 As described by Egeria, for example 1, 11, 13, 14.

36 *Itinerarium Egeriae*, 3, 11, 15, 21; Alfred Stuiber, "Eulogia," in *Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum*, 6 (1966), 900-927.

37 André Grabar, *Ampoules de Terre Sainte* (Monza – Bobbio) (Paris: C. Klincksieck, 1958); Cynthia Hahn, "Loca Sancta Souvenirs: Sealing the Pilgrim's Experience," in *The Blessings of Pilgrimage*, 85-96.

38 Jan Willem Drijvers, *Helena Augusta: The Mother of Constantine the Great and the Legend* 8 *of her Finding of the True Cross*, Leiden: Brill, 1992; Stephan Borgehammar, *How the Holy Cross was Found: From Event to Medieval Legend*, Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell International 1991.

39 Béatrice Dansette, "Les relations du pèlerinage Outre-Mer: des origines à l'âge d'or," in *Croisades et pèlerinages: Récits, chroniques et voyages en terre sainte, XIIe-XVIe siècle* (Danielle Régnier-Bohler, ed., Paris: Bouquins, 1997), 881-892.

40 Mario Iadanza, *Vita Willibaldi episopi Eichstetensis: il vescovo Willibald e la monaca Hugeburc: la scrittura a quattro mani di un'esperienza odeporica del'VIII secolo*, Firenze: Edizione del Galluzzo, 2011; English translation: Wilkinson, *Jerusalem Pilgrims*, 233-251.

41 *Itinerarium Bernardi, monachi franci*, Titus Tobler, *Descriptiones Terrae Sanctae ex saeculo VIII, IX, XII et XV* (Hildesheim and New York: Georg Olms Verlag, 1974[2]), 85-99; English translation: Wilkinson, *Jerusalem Pilgrims*, 261-269.

42 On pilgrims' routes see: Bernard Hamilton, "The way to Rome and Jerusalem: Pilgrim routes from France and Germany at the time of the crusades," in *Santiago, Roma, Jerusalén: Actas del III Congresso Internacional de Estudios Jacobeos* (Xunta de Galicia, 1999), 135-144.

43 Richard Landes, *Relics, Apocalypse, and the Deceits of History: Ademar of Chabbanes, 989–1034* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press,1995). Historians also mention in this context the destruction of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre and other churches in Jerusalem by the Egyptian Caliph Al-Hakim in 1009, catastrophic events in Christian eyes, which brought Jerusalem back to Christian consciousness.

44 Joshua Prawer, *The Crusaders' Kingdom: European Colonialism in the Middle Ages* (New York: Praeger, 2001), 196.

45 Mircea Eliade, *The Sacred and the Profane: The Nature of Religion*, trans. Willard R. Trask (San Diego-New York-London: Harvest/HBJ, 1957), 22.

46 Ibid., 26.

47 Mircea Eliade, *Patterns in Comparative Religion* (London: Sheed and Ward, 1958), 371-72.

48 Ora Limor, "Earth, Stone, Water and Oil: Objects of Veneration in Holy Land Travel Narratives," in *Natural Materials of the Holy Land and the Visual Translation of Place 500–1500* (Renana Bartal, Neta Bodner, Bianca Kühnel (eds.), London & New York: Routledge, 2017), 3–18. On the other hand, one should mention here the absence of spectacular cure miracles at the main pilgrimage sites of Jerusalem, Rome, and to a degree also Santiago de Compostella, as observed by Benedicta Ward and others. See Benedicta Ward, *Miracles and the medieval mind: Theory, record and event 1000-1215* (Aldershot: Wildwood House, 1982), 110-126.

49 Egeria climbed Jabal Musa (Mount Moses) in the Sinai Peninsula. Since the 4th century it is believed to be the biblical Mount Sinai.

50 *Itinerarium Egeriae*, 2, 5-7; English translation: Wilkinson, *Egeria's Travels*, p. 93.

51 Daniel the Abbot, in *Jerusalem pilgrimage 1099-1185* (John Wilkinson, Joyce Hill and W.F. Ryan, eds., London: Hakluyt Society, 1988), 135.

52 W.J.T. Mitchell, "Imperial Landscape," in *Landscape and power* (W.J.T. Mitchell, ed., Chicago and London: Chicago University Press, 1992), 15.

53 On Christian localization of biblical events see: Maurice Halbwachs, *La topographie légendaire des Évangiles en Terre Saine: Étude de mémoire collective* (Paris: Puf, 1941); Maurice Halbwachs, *On Collective Memory*, (Lewis A. Coser, ed. And trans., Chicago and London: Chicago University Press, 1992), 191-235.

54 Halbwachs, *La topographie légendaire*, 157; On Collective Memory, 199.

55 Eliade, *The Sacred and the Profane*, 20-47.

56 Tanhuma to Leviticus, Kdoshim 10.

57 Turner and Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage*, 17-18.

58 Donald R. Howard, *Writers and Pilgrims: Medieval Pilgrimage Narratives and their posterity* (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1980), 12.

59 David Frankfurter, *Pilgrimage and Holy Space in Late Antique Egypt* (Leiden: Brill, 1998), 5.

60 See Aron Gurevitch, *Medieval Popular Culture: Problems of Belief and Perception* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 42.

61 "Praefatio Hieronymi in Librum Paralipomenon juxta LXX interpretes," (*Patrologia Latina* [PL] 29) 401.

62 Ján Elsner and Joan-Pau Rubiés, "Introduction," in *Voyages and Visions: Towards a Cultural History of Travel* (London: Reaktion Books, 1999), 17; See Wilken, The Land Called Holy.

63 Cyrillus Hierosalimitanus, *Catecheses*, 33, 13; 22 (Patrologia Graeca [PG]), 799.

64 Jonathan Z. Smith, *To Take Place. Toward Theory in Ritual*, Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1987), 10, 86-87.

65 *Itinerarium Egeriae* 10:7; English translation, Wilkinson, *Egeria's Travels*, 105-106.

66 Smith, *To take place*, 86; See also Cynthia Hahn, "Seeing and Believing: The Construction of Sanctity in Early-Medieval Saints' Shrines," *Speculum* 72 (1997), 1079- 1106.

67 *Itinerarium Egeriae*, 10:7; Hieronymus, Epistulae, 58.3.

68 *The selected Poems of Yehuda Halevi*, 22 (translated and annotated by Hillel Halkin, Lexington, Mass.: Nextbook Press, 2011).

69 *Rodulfi Glabri Historiarum Libri Quinque*, 4, 6; 18 (John France, ed. and trans., Oxford:

Clarendon Press, 1989), 198–201; I quoted here the translation of Wilkinson, *Jerusalem Pilgrims*, 272-273.

70 Sumption, *Pilgrimage*, 130.

71 Ofer Livne-Kafri, "Jerusalem in Muslim Traditions of the 'End of Days,'" in Livne-Kafri, *Jerusalem in Early Islam Selected Papers* (Jerusalem: Yad Itzhak Ben-Zvi, 2000), 44–77 (Hebrew).